CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP

JOHN W. WHITE EVAN R. CHESLER STEPHEN L. GORDON ROBERT H. BARON DAVID MERCADO CHRISTINE A. VARNEY PETER T. BARBUR MICHAEL S. GOLDMAN RICHARD HALL JULIE A. NORTH ANDREW W. NEEDHAM STEPHEN L. BURNS KATHERINE B. FORREST KEITH R. HUMMEL DAVID J. KAPPOS DANIEL SLIFKIN ROBERT I. TOWNSEND, III PHILIP J. BOECKMAN WILLIAM V. FOGG FAIZA J. SAEED RICHARD J. STARK THOMAS E. DUNN MARK I. GREENE DAVID R. MARRIOTT MICHAEL A. PASKIN ANDREW J. PITTS

MICHAEL T. REYNOLDS

ANTONY L. RYAN GEORGE E. ZOBITZ GEORGE A. STEPHANAKIS DARIN P. MCATEE GARY A. BORNSTEIN TIMOTHY G. CAMERON KARIN A. DEMASI DAVID S. FINKELSTEIN RACHEL G. SKAISTIS PAUL H. ZUMBRO ERIC W. HILFERS GEORGE F. SCHOEN ERIK R. TAVZEL CRAIG F. ARCELLA DAMIEN R. ZOUBEK LAUREN ANGELILLI TATIANA LAPUSHCHIK ALYSSA K. CAPLES JENNIFER S. CONWAY MINH VAN NGO KEVIN J. ORSINI MATTHEW MORREALE JOHN D. BURETTA YONATAN EVEN BENJAMIN GRUENSTEIN JOSEPH D. ZAVAGLIA

Worldwide Plaza 825 Eighth Avenue New York, NY 10019-7475

TELEPHONE: +1-212-474-1000 FACSIMILE: +1-212-474-3700

CITYPOINT
ONE ROPEMAKER STREET
LONDON ECZY 9HR
TELEPHONE: +44-20-7453-1000
FACSIMILE: +44-20-7860-1150

writer's direct dial number +1-212-474-1080

writer's email address bgruenstein@cravath.com

STEPHEN M. KESSING LAUREN A. MOSKOWITZ DAVID J. PERKINS J. LEONARD TETI, D. SCOTT BENNETT TING S. CHEN CHRISTOPHER K. FARGO DAVID M. STUART AARON M. GRUBER O. KEITH HALLAM, III OMID H. NASAB DAMARIS HERNÁNDEZ JONATHAN J. KATZ DAVID L. PORTILLA RORY A. LERARIS KARA L. MUNGOVAN MARGARET T. SEGALL NICHOLAS A. DORSEY ANDREW C. ELKEN JENNY HOCHENBERG VANESSA A. LAVELY G.J. LIGELIS JR. MICHAEL E. MARIANI LAUREN R. KENNEDY SASHA ROSENTHAL-LARREA ALLISON M. WEIN MICHAEL P. ADDIS

JUSTIN C. CLARKE
SHARONMOYEE GOSWAMI
C. DANIEL HAAREN
EVAN MEHRAN NORRIS
LAUREN M. ROSENBERG
MICHAEL L. ARNOLD
HEATHER A. BENJAMIN
MATTHEW J. BOBBY
DANIEL J. CERQUEIRA
ALEXANDRA C. DENNING
HELAM GEBREMARIAM
MATTHEW G. JONES
MATTHEW M. KELLY
DAVID H. KORN
BRITTANY L. SUKIENNIK
ANDREW M. WARK

PARTNER EMERITUS SAMUEL C. BUTLER

OF COUNSEL MICHAEL L. SCHLER CHRISTOPHER J. KELLY

April 2, 2021

Floyd, et al. v. City of New York, 08-CV-1034 (AT) Ligon, et al. v. City of New York, et al., 12-CV-2274 (AT) Davis, et al. v. City of New York, et al., 10-CV-0699 (AT)

Dear Judge Torres:

We are counsel to the Monitor, Peter L. Zimroth, and respectfully write in response to the recent letter from the City of New York (the "City") regarding the order we proposed for the above-captioned matters that clarifies the duties of the City and New York City Police Department ("NYPD") to provide the Monitor with access to information sources.

On March 24, 2021, we filed that draft order (the "Access Order"), which requires the City and NYPD to provide "timely, complete, and direct" access to two categories of information sources: (1) NYPD documents, communications, notes, recordings, and data, and (2) NYPD personnel, facilities, trainings, meetings, and reviews. Ex. 1 to Letter from Benjamin Gruenstein, *Floyd v. City of New York*, No. 08-cv-1034 (AT), ECF No. 818-1, at 2 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 24, 2021). Although the Access Order requires the Monitor to provide "reasonable notice" of requests for access to the

first category of information sources, it does not require the Monitor to provide notice of requests for access to the second. *Id.* On March 29, 2021, the City filed a letter requesting modification of the Access Order so that it would require the Monitor to provide notice of requests for access to the second category. Letter from James E. Johnson, *Floyd v. City of New York*, No. 08-cv-1034 (AT), ECF No. 825, at 2 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 29, 2021).

The City contends that this proposed notice requirement would make the Access Order "more internally consistent," "help facilitate the City's compliance with [the] Monitor's requests", and "promote [a] collaborative relationship" between the City and Monitor. *Id.* But the City's letter is a further illustration that it misunderstands the nature of this monitorship, which operates pursuant to Court order. The notice requirement would impair the Monitor team's ability to conduct unannounced audits of NYPD activities, should they find it useful to perform such audits in the future (as other monitorships have).

Accordingly, the Monitor respectfully requests that this Court enter the Access Order in the form in which it was originally filed.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Benjamin Gruenstein

Benjamin Gruenstein Bradley Niederschulte Sara Bodner

CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP Worldwide Plaza 825 Eighth Avenue New York, New York 10019 Phone: (212) 474-1000

Fax: (212) 474-3700

bgruenstein@cravath.com

Hon. Analisa Torres
United States District Court
Southern District of New York
500 Pearl Street
New York, New York 10007-1312
BY ECF